Knowledge translation intervention to improve evidence-based practice behaviour of allied health professionals: A cluster randomised controlled trial and 2-year follow-up study

Lanie Campbell
University of Notre Dame Australia

Follow this and additional works at: http://researchonline.nd.edu.au/theses

Part of the Medicine and Health Sciences Commons

COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA
Copyright Regulations 1969

WARNING
The material in this communication may be subject to copyright under the Act. Any further copying or communication of this material by you may be the subject of copyright protection under the Act.
Do not remove this notice.

Publication Details
Campbell, L. (2013). Knowledge translation intervention to improve evidence-based practice behaviour of allied health professionals: A cluster randomised controlled trial and 2-year follow-up study (Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)). University of Notre Dame Australia.
http://researchonline.nd.edu.au/theses/89

This dissertation/thesis is brought to you by ResearchOnline@ND. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses by an authorized administrator of ResearchOnline@ND. For more information, please contact researchonline@nd.edu.au.
Knowledge Translation Intervention to Improve Evidence-Based Practice Behaviour of Allied Health Professionals

A cluster randomised controlled trial and 2-year follow-up study

Lanie Campbell
Bachelor of Applied Science Speech Pathology (1991)

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at

University of Notre Dame Australia
November 2013
Declaration

This thesis is composed of my original work, and contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due reference has been made in the text.

The content of my thesis is the result of work I have carried out since the commencement of my research higher degree candidature and does not include a substantial part of work that has been submitted to qualify for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution. No part of my thesis has been submitted to qualify for another award.

____________________  _________________
Signature                     Date
Acknowledgements

Thank you to:

My principal supervisor Associate Professor Iona Novak for providing me with the opportunity to pursue such an interesting and rewarding doctoral degree. Your strategic thinking, work ethic and dedication to cerebral palsy research are admirable. You have diligently mentored me, inspired me and remained engaged with my PhD journey. I am very grateful.

My co-supervisor Sarah McIntyre for your thoroughness, careful consideration and encouragement to persevere. Your example of rigour set the bar high, and you have supported my path towards that goal. I am deeply appreciative of all that you have contributed.

Cerebral Palsy Alliance management team and consultants who endorsed and supported this project from its inception. I would especially like to thank the clinical consultants who provided valuable expertise and support.

Staff at Research Institute Cerebral Palsy Alliance for your input to the project design, development of the online Evidence Alert System and for your ongoing encouragement.

Sarah Lord for invaluable assistance with statistical analysis of the cluster randomised controlled trial.

Allied health professionals at Cerebral Palsy Alliance who participated in the research studies. Without your participation, none of this would have been possible.

My family and friends who provided practical and emotional support, especially my parents and sister Cheryl.

Miles, Finn, Henry and Dudley— you have kept me grounded and helped me remember what is important. Thanks for your belief in me and for coming on this adventure with me.
Abstract

**Background:** It is difficult to foster the use of research findings among allied health professionals (AHPs). Tailored, multifaceted knowledge translation (KT) strategies are now recommended but are resource intensive to implement. Employers need effective KT solutions, but little is known about: (a) the impact and viability of multifaceted KT strategies using an online KT tool, (b) their immediate and longer-term effectiveness with AHPs, and (c) their effect on evidence-based practice (EBP) decision-making behaviour. The aim of this project was to measure the effectiveness of a multifaceted KT intervention including a customised KT tool, to change EBP behaviour, knowledge and attitudes of AHPs over an 8-week period and at 2-years.

**Methods:** The first study was an evaluator-blinded, cluster randomised controlled trial (RCT) conducted in a community-based cerebral palsy service. AHPs (135 physiotherapists, occupational therapists, speech pathologists, psychologists and social workers) from 4 regions were cluster randomized (n = 4), to either the KT intervention group (n = 73) or the control group (n = 62), using computer-generated random numbers, concealed in opaque envelopes, by an independent officer. The KT intervention included a 3-day skills training workshop and workplace support to redress barriers (paid EBP time, mentoring, system changes and access to an online research synthesis tool). Primary RCT outcome (self- and peer-rated EBP behaviour) was measured using the Goal Attainment Scale (individual level). Secondary RCT outcomes (knowledge and attitudes) were measured using exams and the Evidence Based Practice Attitude Scale.

The second study was a follow-up study 2-years after the completion of the RCT using an online survey. The survey included: (a) questions based on Goal Attainment Scale, and (b) questions relating to the utilisation and usefulness of an evidence alert system.
**Results** RCT - the intervention group’s primary outcome scores improved relative to the control group, however when clustering was taken into account, the findings were non-significant: self-rated EBP behaviour [effect size 4.97; 95% confidence interval (CI)-10.47, 20.41; p = 0.52]; peer-rated EBP behaviour (effect size 5.86; 95% CI-17.77, 29.50; p = 0.62). Statistically significant improvements in EBP knowledge were detected (effect size 2.97; 95% CI 1.97, 3.97; p < 0.0001). Change in EBP attitudes was not statistically significant. Two-year follow-up study - AHPs’ KT strategy GAS T-scores improved (GAS T-score change from RCT to 2-years = 29.58; 95% CI 12.66, 46.52; p = 0.02).

**Conclusions** The two studies suggest meaningful gains in EBP behaviour, with consistent GAS peer-ratings and self-ratings in the RCT, along with an overall increase in GAS T-scores in the 2-year follow-up study. This cannot be stated with certainty however, due to methodological issues due to pragmatic constraints. The large variability in behaviour observed between clusters suggests barrier assessments and subsequent KT interventions may need to target subgroups within an organisation.
# Table of Contents

Declaration........................................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements......................................................................................................................... iii
Abstract............................................................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents........................................................................................................................... vi
List of Tables......................................................................................................................................... x
List of Figures ........................................................................................................................................ xi
List of Appendices............................................................................................................................ xii
Abbreviations....................................................................................................................................... xiii

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................... 1

Overview............................................................................................................................................... 1
Background........................................................................................................................................... 1
Statement of the problem.................................................................................................................... 2
Research aims and methods ................................................................................................................ 3
  Research questions ........................................................................................................................ 4
Thesis outline......................................................................................................................................... 4

## CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW .......................................................................... 6

Overview............................................................................................................................................... 6
Evidence-based practice....................................................................................................................... 6
  Definition of evidence-based medicine........................................................................................... 6
  History of evidence-based medicine .............................................................................................. 7
  Why use EBM? ............................................................................................................................... 8
  EBP in the allied health professions ............................................................................................... 8
The research–practice gap .................................................................................................................. 9
Knowledge translation .......................................................................................................................... 10
Theories and models underpinning knowledge translation ............................................................. 10
  Conceptual KT models.................................................................................................................. 11
  KT theories ..................................................................................................................................... 16
Barriers to EBP implementation........................................................................................................ 23
  Support/resource barriers .............................................................................................................. 24
  Cognitive/behavioural barriers ......................................................................................................... 25
  Attitudinal/rational-emotive barriers ............................................................................................. 25
  Clinical practice guideline/evidence barriers ...................................................................................... 25
  Client barriers .............................................................................................................................. 26
  Health care professional/physician barriers .................................................................................... 27
  System/process barriers .................................................................................................................. 27
Strategies aiming to change health professionals’ EBP behaviour ............................................... 28
  Face-to-face educational meetings ................................................................................................... 29
  Retrieval of electronic health information ...................................................................................... 30
  Printed educational materials .......................................................................................................... 30
Outreach visits (mentoring) ................................................................. 31
Opinion leaders .................................................................................. 31
Audit and feedback ............................................................................. 32
Journal clubs ....................................................................................... 32
Financial Incentives .......................................................................... 33
Organisational change – strategic planning, management training .... 33
Tailored interventions ........................................................................ 34
Multifaceted KT strategies ................................................................. 34
Knowledge translation in the allied health professions ................. 37
Measuring the outcomes of multifaceted KT strategies ................. 40
Domains of evaluation ....................................................................... 40
Gaps in the literature ........................................................................ 44
1. No RCTs with an evidence-based information resource as a key
element of a KT strategy ................................................................. 45
2. No studies involving AHPs have attempted to measure a wide range of
EBP behaviour .............................................................................. 45
3. No RCTs sampling a range of professional groups ..................... 46
4. No RCTs with AHPs that have used a strong KT theoretical framework .. 46
Rationale for the studies ................................................................. 46
Rationale for the randomised controlled trial .................................. 46
Rationale for the follow-up study .................................................... 47
Synopsis ............................................................................................ 47

CHAPTER 3 RANDOMISED CONTROLLED TRIAL METHODS ........ 48
Overview .......................................................................................... 48
Aim and hypotheses ........................................................................ 48
Trial design ....................................................................................... 49
Setting .............................................................................................. 50
Ethics ................................................................................................. 51
Eligibility .......................................................................................... 51
Blinding ............................................................................................ 52
Randomisation ................................................................................. 52
Intervention ...................................................................................... 53
Assessment of barriers and facilitators ........................................... 53
Development of multifaceted intervention .................................... 53
KT intervention group .................................................................. 54
Control group ................................................................................ 60
Primary outcomes .......................................................................... 62
Goal attainment scaling ................................................................. 62
Secondary study outcomes ............................................................ 63
Open-ended exam questions .......................................................... 63
Evidence based practice attitude scale ........................................ 63
Use of the cerebral palsy evidence alert system ........................ 64
Procedures and data collection ................................................................. 67
Data cleaning ............................................................................................ 70
Sample size and power .............................................................................. 70
Statistical methods ................................................................................. 71
Synopsis ..................................................................................................... 72

CHAPTER 4 RANDOMISED CONTROLLED TRIAL RESULTS .......... 73
Overview .................................................................................................. 73
Baseline characteristics ......................................................................... 73
  Professional background ....................................................................... 76
  Grade level ............................................................................................ 76
  Years at Cerebral Palsy Alliance and experience in the disability field .. 77
  English as first language ...................................................................... 78
  Previous continuing education in EBP ................................................... 79
Participant flow ....................................................................................... 80
Missing Data ............................................................................................ 80
Clustering effect ...................................................................................... 81
Effectiveness of KT strategy ................................................................... 81
  Primary outcome – EBP practice behaviours ........................................ 81
  Secondary outcomes – knowledge, attitudes and EAS ......................... 82
  Additional analyses ............................................................................ 82
Synopsis .................................................................................................. 83

CHAPTER 5 2-YEAR FOLLOW-UP STUDY METHODS ..................... 87
Overview .................................................................................................. 87
Background ............................................................................................. 87
Aims and hypothesis ................................................................................. 88
Trial design ............................................................................................... 89
Survey Design .......................................................................................... 89
  Pilot testing .......................................................................................... 90
Eligibility .................................................................................................. 90
Ethics ........................................................................................................ 91
Procedures ............................................................................................... 91
Statistical analysis .................................................................................. 91
  Calculating change in GAS T-scores .................................................... 93
  Missing data ........................................................................................ 93
Synopsis .................................................................................................. 93

CHAPTER 6 2-YEAR FOLLOW-UP STUDY RESULTS ..................... 94
Overview .................................................................................................. 94
Survey results – all survey participants .................................................. 94
  Participant flow & baseline characteristics ........................................ 94
Results relating to Evidence Alert System ............................................ 96
List of Figures

Figure 1: The evidence-based medicine triad .......................................................... 7
Figure 2: Knowledge-to-Action (KTA) process ...................................................... 12
Figure 3: The 5S pyramid model of evidence-based information resources ........ 14
Figure 4: RCT trial design ............................................................................... 50
Figure 5: EAS infogram ................................................................................. 55
Figure 6: Study structure and measures ............................................................. 67
Figure 7: Percentage of participants in various professional backgrounds in intervention and control groups ............................................................... 76
Figure 8: Percentage of participants for AHP grade levels in intervention and control groups ....................................................................................... 77
Figure 9: Percentage of participants according to number of years employed at Cerebral Palsy Alliance in intervention and control groups ...................... 77
Figure 10: Percentage of participants according to number of years working in disability in intervention and control groups ............................................. 78
Figure 11: Percentage of participants whose first language was English in intervention and control groups ............................................................... 79
Figure 12: Percentage of participants who had previous continuing education in EBP in intervention and control groups ................................................... 79
Figure 13: Participant flow diagram for RCT – from randomisation to primary analysis ........................................................................................................ 80
Figure 14: Participant flow throughout entire study ................................................. 98
List of Appendices

APPENDIX 1 Oxford Centre for Evidence-based Medicine ......................131
APPENDIX 2 National Ethics Application approval letters ......................139
APPENDIX 3 Evidence Alert System .....................................................141
APPENDIX 4 Information Sheet for Staff Participants ..........................153
APPENDIX 5 Self-evaluation Form .......................................................157
APPENDIX 6 Peer Evaluation Form .....................................................166
APPENDIX 7 Marking Criteria for Exam ...............................................172
APPENDIX 8 2-year Follow-up Survey ................................................174
APPENDIX 9 Journal paper accepted for publication by Implementation Science .................................................................188
APPENDIX 10 Conference presentations and posters .............................228
# Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHP</td>
<td>allied health professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CI</td>
<td>confidence interval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAS</td>
<td>evidence alert system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBM</td>
<td>evidence-based medicine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBP</td>
<td>evidence-based practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBPAS</td>
<td>evidence-based practice attitude scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAS</td>
<td>goal attainment scaling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>intra-cluster correlation co-efficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KT</td>
<td>knowledge translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KTA</td>
<td>knowledge-to action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEAF</td>
<td>national ethics application form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTseeker</td>
<td>occupational therapy systematic evaluation of evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEDro</td>
<td>physiotherapy evidence database</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCT</td>
<td>randomised controlled trial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sd</td>
<td>standard deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SpeechBITE</td>
<td>speech pathology database for best interventions and treatment efficacy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>