Perceptions of leaders, teachers, students and parents in high performing West Australian Catholic secondary schools within the context of tertiary entrance examinations

Michael O'Neill
University of Notre Dame Australia

Follow this and additional works at: http://researchonline.nd.edu.au/theses
Part of the Education Commons

COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA
Copyright Regulations 1969

WARNING
The material in this communication may be subject to copyright under the Act. Any further copying or communication of this material by you may be the subject of copyright protection under the Act.
Do not remove this notice.

Publication Details
O'Neill, M. (2014). Perceptions of leaders, teachers, students and parents in high performing West Australian Catholic secondary schools within the context of tertiary entrance examinations (Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)). University of Notre Dame Australia.
http://researchonline.nd.edu.au/theses/88

This dissertation/thesis is brought to you by ResearchOnline@ND. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses by an authorized administrator of ResearchOnline@ND. For more information, please contact researchonline@nd.edu.au.
Perceptions of Leaders, Teachers, Students and Parents in high performing West Australian Catholic secondary schools within the context of Tertiary Entrance Examinations.

Submitted by

Michael. R. O’Neill

B.A. Hons. (Murdoch University), Grad. Dip. Ed. (Murdoch University), M.Ed Leadership and Management (University of Western Australia), M. Ed. Religious Education (University of Notre Dame Australia)

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO FULFIL THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

School of Education

The University of Notre Dame Australia

Fremantle Campus

January 2014
ABSTRACT

As for most of the developed world, Australia is no different in its scrupulous evaluation of school performance data. Annually much attention is given to data surrounding the performance of students, teachers and schools in high stakes Tertiary Entrance Examinations as students seek to qualify for a variety of university programs. So called ‘league tables’ are produced measuring school performance on a number of criteria which differ marginally from state to state. Such tables identify both successful and less successful schools. Notwithstanding the limitations of such comparisons and the fact that success is a relative term there is a great deal of interest in the factors that contribute to the attainment of success in the Tertiary Entrance Examination context.

This qualitative study identifies and interprets the factors attributed to the success of nine selected secondary schools in the Catholic Education System of Western Australia that have consistently outperformed other ‘like’ schools (as measured by their socio-economic index) in the context of the state Tertiary Entrance Examinations. The schools in the study differed on factors such as socio-economic status, gender composition and geographic location.

The purpose of the study was four-fold. Firstly, to identify characteristics of leaders in schools that have been identified as ‘successful’. Secondly, to identify characteristics of teaching that has resulted in high achievement in the Tertiary Entrance Examinations. Thirdly, to identify characteristics of the student contribution to their schools’ success; and finally, to identify the contribution and perceptions of parents in the selected high performing schools. Significantly, the study sought to obtain a ‘gestalt’ of effective schools by exploring whether the perceptions of each group contributed to a holistic
understanding of the factors defining a successful school, in the context of the Tertiary Entrance Examination success.

The qualitative research methodology utilized individual semi-structured interviews to gain data from principals and deputy principals in all nine schools. Semi-structured focus group interviews were employed with regard to heads of subject departments, teachers, students and parents across all nine schools. Within the qualitative epistemology, the theoretical perspective employed was an interpretative phenomenological analysis. The data collected was analysed using open coding. The use of four data sets allowed for data triangulation that provided a multi-dimensional and layered portrait of effective schools.

Schools striving to attain the epithet ‘successful’ might make use of findings as a valuable commencement point. Practical strategies for authentic whole school improvement that sustains student achievement are presented.
Statement of Sources

This thesis contains no material published elsewhere in whole or part from a thesis by which I have qualified for or been awarded another degree or diploma. No other person’s work has been used without due acknowledgement in the main text of the thesis. This thesis has not been submitted for the award of any degree or diploma in any other tertiary institution. All research procedures reported in the thesis received the approval of the relevant Ethics Committees.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge the former Director of Catholic Education in WA Mr Ron Dullard for his support of this project and permission to access longitudinal data on Catholic schools’ performance in the tertiary examinations in Western Australia. To the leaders, teachers, past students and parents of the participating schools, a sincere thanks for your generosity of time and your insightful and honest reflections.

To Anne Coffey, Shane Lavery, Lou Thomson, and Jennifer Oaten who acted as research assistants in this project I am duly indebted to you for your support in the gathering of data and your insightful contributions to the early phase of the project.

To Professor Richard Berlach my supervisor, your constant support and gentle and positive encouragement will never be forgotten. I have learned so much under your experience and guidance.

Most of all I dedicate this thesis to my family. To my sons Daniel and Sean I am always amazed by your talents, strength and persistence. You have been an inspiration to me. To my wife Irene you have been my constant source of encouragement and I cannot begin to thank you for your love and patience.

Finally to my parents who made such a sacrifice to provide me with a quality education, I wish you were here to see its fruition.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. CHAPTER ONE – INTRODUCTION  1
   1.1. Introduction  1
   1.2. Overview  1
   1.3. Purpose  1
   1.4. Context of the Research  4
      1.4.1. Accountability  4
      1.4.2. The System  6
      1.4.3. Measuring Successful Schools  6
   1.5. Process of Data Collection  11
   1.6. Research Questions  12
   1.7. Potential Significance  13
   1.8. Rationale for the Chosen Methodology  14
   1.9. Structure of the Thesis  15

2. CHAPTER TWO – LITERATURE REVIEW  18
   2.1. Introduction  18
   2.2. Conceptual Framework  18
   2.3. The Role of Leaders in Effective and Improving Schools  19
      2.3.1. Instructional Leadership  20
      2.3.2. Transformational Leadership  24
      2.3.3. Distributed Leadership  26
      2.3.3.1 The Head of the Department (HOD)  29
      2.3.4. Sustainable Leadership  31
      2.3.5. Summary: Models of Leadership  37
   2.4. The Characteristics of Effective Teachers in High Performing and Improving Schools  37
      2.4.1. School and Teacher Effectiveness: Introduction  37
      2.4.2. Teacher Effectiveness  39
      2.4.3. Recent Studies  41
   2.5. The Influence of Students and their Peers on Academic Achievement  61
      2.5.1. Introduction  61
      2.5.2. Motivation  61
      2.5.3. Extrinsic and Intrinsic Motivation  62
      2.5.4. Theories of Motivation  62
      2.5.5. Behavioural Theories of Motivation  63
      2.5.6. Humanistic Theories of Motivation  63
      2.5.7. Personalisation  65
      2.5.8. Social Cognition: Attribution Theory  70
      2.5.9. Positive Psychology and Well Being  72
      2.5.10. Peer Association  73
   2.6. The Student Voice: Introduction  76
2.6.1. The Role of the Student Voice 77
2.6.2. Summary: The Role of the Student Voice 81
2.7. The Role of Parents and their Influence on Student Academic Achievement:
   Introduction 81
   2.7.1. Relational Trust 82
   2.7.2. Parental Involvement and Academic Achievement 86
   2.7.3. Parent Constructive Behaviour and Adolescent Affiliation 91
   2.7.4. Influence of Parental and Peer Attachment 93
   2.7.5. Teachers and Family-School Partnerships 94
   2.7.6. School Choice: What Parents Value 96
   2.7.7. Parent Feedback 97
2.8. Chapter Summary 98

3. CHAPTER THREE – METHODOLOGY 100
   3.1. Introduction: Theoretical Framework 100
   3.2. Epistemology: Qualitative Research 101
   3.3. An Interpretivist Theoretical Perspective 103
   3.4. Hermeneutic Understanding 105
   3.5. Phenomenology 105
   3.6. Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) 108
   3.7. Research Methods 110
      3.7.1. Data Collection/Data Sample 110
      3.7.2. Interviewing from within an IPA Worldview 112
      3.7.3. Individual Semi-Structured Interviews 113
      3.7.4. Semi-Structured Focus Group Interviews 116
      3.7.5. Field Notes and Journals 118
      3.7.6. Data Analysis of Individual Semi-Structured Interviews using an IPA
             Approach 121
      3.7.7. Data Analysis of Semi-Structured Interviews with Focus Groups: Using
             an IPA Approach 123
      3.7.8. Trustworthiness 123
      3.7.9. Instruments 125
   3.8. Procedure 125
   3.9. Limitations and Safeguards 126
   3.10. Ethical Considerations 126
   3.11. Summary 127

4. CHAPTER FOUR – PERCEPTIONS OF LEADERS: PRESENTATION OF
   FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 128
   4.1. Introduction 128
   4.2. Principals’ Perceptions 128
      4.2.1. Principals’ Perceptions of their Roles 128
4.2.2.1 Setting the Vision 128
4.2.2.2 Leading Improvement 131
4.2.1.3 Use of Data 131
4.2.1.4 Alternative Academic Pathways 134
4.2.1.5 Team Focus 135
4.2.2. Principals’ Perceptions of Deputy Principals 136
4.2.3. Principals’ Perceptions of Heads of Subject Departments 137
4.2.4. Principals’ Perceptions of Teachers 138
4.2.5. Principals’ Perceptions of Students 141
4.2.6. Principals’ Perceptions of Parents 143
4.2.7. Principals’ Perceptions of the Culture of the School 145

4.3. Perceptions of Deputy Principals: Introduction 146
4.3.1. Deputy Principals’ Perceptions: Their Role 147
4.3.1.1 Counselling of students and use of data 147
4.3.1.2 Student wellbeing 147
4.3.2. Deputy Principals’ Perceptions: Teacher-Student Relations 149
4.3.3. Deputy Principals’ Perceptions: Parents 151
4.3.4. Deputy Principals’ Perceptions: Culture of the School and Alignment with Principals’ Vision 151
4.3.5. Perceptions of Heads of Subject Departments: Introduction 154

4.4. Heads’ of Subject Departments Perceptions of their Role 155
4.4.1. Relationships and Teams 156
4.5.1.1 Communication in the department 157
4.5.1.2 Planning and programming 158
4.5.1.3 Assessment 160
4.5.1.4 Feedback 160
4.4.2. Heads’ of Department Perceptions: Selection and Development of Teachers 162
4.4.3. Heads’ of Department Perceptions of Students 163
4.4.4. Heads’ of Department Perceptions of Parents 165

4.5. Chapter Summary 166

5. **CHAPTER FIVE – PERCEPTIONS OF TEACHERS: PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION** 169
5.1. Perceptions of Teachers: Introduction 169
5.2. Content Knowledge 169
5.3. Passion and Enthusiasm 173
5.4. Teachers’ Perceptions Concerning Effective Teaching Strategies 176
5.4.1. Direct Instruction, Whole Class Discussion and Collaborative Learning 176
5.4.2. Note Taking 176
5.4.3. Meta-Cognition 178
5.5. Curriculum Design 179
5.6. Organisation, Structure and an Orderly Environment 180
5.7. Assessment Types 182
5.8. Regular Timely Feedback 183
5.9. Professional Development 185
  5.9.1. Formal External Professional Development 185
  5.9.2. Formal Internal Professional Development 189
  5.9.3. Informal Internal Professional Development 191
5.10. Teachers' Perceptions of the Role of Parents 192
5.11. Teachers' Perceptions of Students 194
5.12. Teachers' Perceptions of the Culture of the School 195
  5.12.1. The Teacher – Student Relationship 195
  5.12.2. Collegial Relationships 197
  5.12.3. Culture of Excellence and High Expectations 198
  5.12.4. Safe and Orderly Environment 199
  5.12.5. Catholic Identity 199
5.13. Summary 201

6. CHAPTER SIX – PERCEPTIONS OF STUDENTS: PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 204
6.1. Students' Perceptions: Introduction 204
6.2. Teachers and Relationships 204
6.3. Enthusiasm and Passion 206
6.4. Teachers' Content Knowledge 209
6.5. Teachers' Strategies 211
  6.5.1. Organisational Skills 213
  6.5.2. Feedback 214
6.6. Students' Perceptions of Leaders 217
6.7. Students' Perceptions of the Culture of the School 218
6.8. Students' Perceptions of Peer Influence 222
6.9. Students' Perceptions of Parental Influence 226
6.10. Student Voice 229

7. CHAPTER SEVEN – PERCEPTIONS OF PARENTS: PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 232
7.1. Perceptions of Parents: Introductions 232
7.2. Parents' Perceptions of Leadership in the School 232
7.3. Parents' Perceptions of Teachers 236
  7.3.1. Teacher-Student Relationship 237
  7.3.2. Communication 240
  7.3.3. Feedback 241
  7.3.4. Affective Qualities of Teachers 242
7.4. Parents' Perceptions concerning Academic Results 243
7.5. Parents' Perceptions of Culture 246
7.6. Parents' Perceptions of the Peer Group Influence 248
7.7. Parental Perceptions of their own Influence on Student Academic Achievement 251
   7.7.1. Social and Emotional Support 251
7.8. Parental Engagement with School Activities 253

8. CHAPTER EIGHT – CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 258
8.1. Introduction 258
8.2. Leaders’ Perceptions: Introduction 259
   8.2.1. Aligned Strategic Leadership 259
   8.2.2. A Blended Model of Leadership 260
   8.2.3. Holistic Vision 261
8.3. Curriculum Design and Heads of Subject Departments 263
8.4. Perceptions of Leaders: Conclusions and Recommendations 263
8.5. Perceptions of Teachers: Conclusions and Recommendations 265
   8.5.1. Teachers’ Orientation to the Subject Matter 265
   8.5.2. Teacher-Student Relationships: A Manifestation of Love and Care 266
   8.5.3. Pedagogy and Curriculum Design 266
   8.5.4. Professional Development 268
   8.5.5. Teachers’ Perceptions of the Student Micro-Culture 269
   8.5.6. The Teacher-Parent Relationship 269
   8.5.7. Teachers’ Perceptions in Summary 270
8.6. Perceptions of Students: Conclusions and Recommendations 271
   8.6.1. Students and Leadership 272
   8.6.2. To be Known 272
   8.6.3. The Teacher-Student Relationship: Sustaining Passion and Enthusiasm 272
   8.6.4. Students’ Perceptions Concerning Teacher Content Knowledge and Pedagogy 273
   8.6.5. Students’ ‘insider’ Perceptions of their Peer Culture 275
   8.6.6. Students’ Perceptions of Parents: Being There 275
   8.6.7. Students’ Perceptions: Summary and Recommendations 276
8.7. Perceptions of Parents: Conclusions and recommendations 279
   8.7.1. Leadership is Pivotal 279
   8.7.2. The Teacher is Everything 279
   8.7.3. The Pervasive Peer Culture 281
   8.7.4. Parental Reflections on their Own Influence: Emotional Support and Aligned Values 281
   8.7.5. Parents’ Perceptions Summary and Recommendations 282
8.8. Concluding Statement 284
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Overview of Thesis Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Factors affecting student achievement (Marzano, 2003, p. 10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Categories of instructional strategies that affect student achievement (Marzano, 2003, p. 80)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Effect size on influences on student achievement (Hattie, 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Effect size on influences on student achievement. Adapted from (Hattie, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Effect size on teacher influences on student achievement (adapted from Hattie, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Crotty’s four elements of the research process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Study data set</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Stages of IPA analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Leaders’ perceptions of factors contributing to schools’ success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Teachers’ perceptions of factors contributing to their schools’ success in relation to their personal practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Teachers’ perceptions of ‘whole school’ factors and influences of other stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Students’ perceptions of teachers’ and leaders’ influence on academic achievement and overall school success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Students’ perceptions of school culture, peers and parental influence on academic achievement and overall school success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Perceptions of parents in relation to factors that contributed to their children’s high academic achievement and overall success of their school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Cultural factors parents believed contributed to their children’s high academic achievement and the overall academic success of their school</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Marks adjustment process</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Conceptual framework</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Percentage of student year by use of time</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Sample student timetable at TechBoston High School (Shields &amp; Miles, 2008, p. 44)</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Blended model of leadership</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Holistic school vision</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>