That All may be One

Mary-Anne Lumley

Follow this and additional works at: https://researchonline.nd.edu.au/pastoral-liturgy

Part of the Catholic Studies Commons, and the Liturgy and Worship Commons

Recommended Citation
Lumley, Mary-Anne. "That All may be One." Pastoral Liturgy 52, no. 2 (2021): 1-7. DOI: https://doi.org/10.59405/2653-7834.1076
That all may be one: on being guardians of the Sacrament of Unity
By Mary-Anne Lumley

This article is peer reviewed

I ask not only on behalf of these, but also on behalf of those who will believe in me through their word, that they may all be one. As you, Father, are in me and I am in you, may they also be in us. The glory that you have given me I have given them, so that they may be one, as we are one, I in them and you in me, that they may become completely one.

John 17:20-23

An aggiornamento, a bringing up to date of the Church in the modern world, was the vision of the Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, 1962-1965. This year marks the sixtieth anniversary of the opening of the council, which was convoked by Pope John XXIII, although arguably the seed was already sown during the papacy of his predecessor. Worldwide, the Church has begun a synodal journey. According to Archbishop Mark Coleridge of Brisbane, the synodal path is ‘from the heart of Vatican II’s understanding of the Church as the pilgrim people of God’ who are called to share in responsibility for mission.¹ In Australia, the Plenary Council process interweaves with that of the synod; both call the baptised into holiness and communion. Pope Francis has iterated that his spirituality is formed by the Second Vatican Council and when he issued the motu proprio, Traditionis Custodes in July 2021, he emphasised that the Roman Missal reformed by Vatican II and promulgated by Pope Paul VI in 1970 is the ‘unique expression of the lex orandi of the Roman Rite’.² This paper seeks to outline some of the articles of Traditionis Custodes and why Pope Francis has deemed it necessary at this time. There is reference to reasons why some Catholics might be drawn to the Tridentine Mass and some pastoral considerations and responses. The intent in this discussion is to avoid polemics and to propose, for the whole Church, a renewed and deeper engagement with the teaching of Vatican II.

THE VITALITY OF THE ROMAN RITE

For many centuries Christian communities have been nourished by the Mass of the Roman Rite, the liturgy as reformed by mandate of Vatican II.³ During this time it has evolved in many disparate contexts from the early Church to the Council of Trent in the sixteenth century. Keith Pecklers has documented some of these varied circumstances which include: the Latin language taking over from Greek in the third and fourth centuries; early texts composed by bishops and priests being collated, copied and shared; more formal structures being integrated into the liturgy, in addition to flourishes from other societies in Europe and beyond; the lack of theological understanding, liturgical abuses and even superstitious practices resulting from a growing separation of the papacy and local church communities, compounded by lack of training for priests.⁴ Hence, the Council of Trent sought to formalise the Mass to be universally recognisable.

Pecklers proposes the view that the Roman Rite has ‘endured to our own day precisely because of its capacity to adapt and be shaped by the distinct cultures where it has been celebrated’. In the mid-twentieth century, the reformed Missale Romanum was one of the fruits of the Vatican II, with the constitution Sacrosanctum Concilium having mandated that the ‘substantial unity of the Roman Rite [be] preserved’. The Roman Rite embraces the ‘soberness’ of continuity with its origins, yet the ‘sense’ of being animated and shaped in varying cultural circumstances. It is incumbent on the Church, according to Pecklers, to continue to be proactive and intentional in ‘contextualising and incarnating that Roman Rite within the diverse cultural contexts in which it is lived and celebrated.

**TRADITIONIS CUSTODES & VATICAN II**

Translated as ‘Guardians of the Tradition’, Traditionis Custodes is addressed to bishops who, as Cardinal Blaise Cupich of Chicago elaborates, ‘share responsibility for the whole Church’ as custodians of the teaching passed on from the apostles. At the heart of Traditionis Custodes, Summarum Pontificum and Ecclesiae Dei, issued respectively by Pope Francis, Pope Benedict and Pope John Paul, is a desire for ecclesial unity, a unity that is made manifest through the celebration of the Eucharist and articulated in the documents of Vatican II, including Lumen Gentium. Lumen Gentium affirms that by ‘sharing in the body of the Lord in the breaking of the Eucharistic bread, we are taken up into communion with him and with one another’. Martos argues that the conciliar revisions of the Mass, inviting ‘greater congregational participation’, were directed towards a deeper understanding of the Eucharist as a ‘sign of Christian unity’. Citing Lumen Gentium, he observes that unity is the most frequently occurring theme in discussion of the Eucharist. Solari asserts that such unity is more than a vague feeling of ‘togetherness’; more accurately ‘the Church is … communion itself’. Surely this is the unity for which Jesus prayed during the Last Supper discourse (John 17: 20-26). The Church is Christ’s body and, in celebrating the Liturgy of the Church, the faithful ‘should be drawn day by day into ever more perfect union with God and with each other, so that finally God may be all in all’.

In Traditionis Custodes and its accompanying letter, Pope Francis expresses the commitment to ‘press on ever more in the constant search for ecclesial communion’. He calls on each local bishop – in his competence as ‘moderator, promoter, and guardian of the whole liturgical life of the particular Church entrusted to him’ – to cooperate in referring to the authority of the teachings of Vatican II with the Missale Romanum mandated in 1970.

---

5 Pecklers, The Genius of the Roman Rite, ix.
11 Joseph Martos, Doors to the Sacred (Ligouri: Ligouri Triumph, 2001), 267.
12 Martos, Doors to the Sacred, 266-267.
14 SC, sec.48.
15 Francis, Traditionis Custodes.
16 Francis, Traditionis Custodes, art. 2.
Significantly, the Pope expresses concern at the lack of unity expressed through the ‘rejection not only of the liturgical reform, but of the Vatican Council II itself’. Indeed, in 1976, this desire for unity was also fostered by Pope Paul VI in addressing newly appointed cardinals. Pope Paul called upon all Catholic communities ‘to celebrate the renewed Liturgy in dignity and fervour’, as people who are ‘congregavit nos in unum Christi amor’. Paul VI made clear the parallel between the promulgation of the Mass of Trent and that of Vatican II. He iterated that the ‘new Ordo Missae is certainly not left to the discretion of priests or faithful … [it] was promulgated to replace the old, after mature deliberation, following the requests of the Second Vatican Council. Not unlike our holy predecessor Pius V had made the reformed Missal obligatory under his authority, following the Council of Trent’.  

*Traditionis Custodes* places certain restrictions on how and where the pre-Vatican Mass may be celebrated. The directive also places some limits on who may preside at a Tridentine Mass. As custodians of the tradition, local bishops will seek to uphold the ecclesial unity requested by *Traditionis Custodes*. As shepherds they will continue to tend to the people of God in their care – to lead, guide and form them in all their diversity. *Traditionis Custodes* allows for the provision of the Tridentine Mass for existing congregations, with the strongest proviso that these groups do not deny the ‘validity and the legitimacy of the liturgical reform, dictated by Vatican Council II’. However, bishops are ‘not to authorise the establishment of new groups’. Most critical is the choice of priest who requires authorisation from the local bishop and then, as the bishop’s delegate, has responsibility for the congregation. (For newly ordained priests, the diocesan bishop will need to seek approval from the Holy See). The *motu proprio* states that not only should the priest be competent in Latin and the rubrics of the preconciliar Mass, he must also ‘be animated by a lively pastoral charity and by a sense of ecclesial communion’ and give priority to ‘the pastoral and spiritual care of the faithful’. The issue of formation of clergy was further elaborated by the Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments in the *responsa ad dubia* issued to bishops in November 2021. Formateurs are encouraged to accompany seminarians towards ‘understanding and experiencing … the richness of the liturgical reform … [which] … has enhanced every element of the Roman Rite and has fostered … the full, conscious and active participation of the entire People of God in the liturgy’. Clearly the pre-Vatican II Mass may not replace other parish liturgies, nor may it be advertised. In the letter accompanying the *motu proprio*, Pope Francis expects that dioceses will ‘return in due time to the Roman Rite promulgated by Saints Paul VI and John Paul II’.  

While the three popes – Paul VI, John Paul II, Benedict XVI – have successively made concessions with regard to the use of the Tridentine Mass, in order to achieve unity, *Traditionis Custodes* is more urgent in its insistence on remaining true to the teaching of the council. In the first article of *Traditionis Custodes*, Pope Francis’ unequivocally states that the Missals promulgated by Popes Paul and John Paul II are the singular form of the Roman  

17 Francis, Letter of the Holy Father Francis to the bishops of the whole world, that accompanies the apostolic letter motu proprio data “Traditionis Custodes”, Vatican website, July 16, 2021,  
18 Paul VI, Secret Consistory of the Holy Father Paul VI for the Appointment of Twenty Cardinals, Speech, Vatican website, 24 May, 1976, sec. 2a,  
http://www.vatican.va/content/paul-vi-it/speeches/1976/documents/hf_p-vi_spe_19760524_concistoro.html  
19 Paul VI, Secret Consistory of the Holy Father Paul VI for the Appointment of Twenty Cardinals, sec. 2a  
20 Francis, Traditionis Custodes, art. 3 #1.  
21 Francis, Traditionis Custodes, art. 6.  
22 Francis, Traditionis Custodes, art. 4.  
https://press.vatican.va/content/salastampa/it/bollettino pubblico/2021/12/18/0860/01814.html#ing  
24 The *responsa ad dubia* clarifies circumstances in which the Tridentine Mass may be celebrated in parish churches.  
25 Francis, Letter of the Holy Father Francis to the bishops of the whole world.  
26 The respective statements of John Paul II and Benedict were especially prompted by the desire and hope for unity with followers of Monsignor Marcel LeFevre.
Rite. This contrasts with the pronouncement of Pope Benedict in *Summorum Pontificum*. Pope Benedict names the Missal of 1970 the ‘ordinary form’ and also allows for the 1962 Missal as an ‘extraordinary expression of the same lex orandi of the Church and duly honoured for its venerable and ancient usage’. Over several centuries, this axiom of *lex orandi lex credendi* – as we pray, so do we believe – has been used. The symbols, actions, words, song, gestures and art of the liturgy cannot but reflect the beliefs of those gathered in celebration. This alignment of prayer and belief is central to the gathering of the people of God in the Eucharist and is underscored in *Traditionis Custodes*. Similarly, to reject the post-Vatican II Mass is to reject the authority of the council and break communion with the Church.

*Traditionis Custodes* refers to all the council’s reforms of the liturgy, not just the change to the vernacular from Latin. The changes made in the Mass, in accordance with *Sacrosanctum Concilium* were to assist the faithful to participate devoutly and actively and to more clearly reveal the ‘intrinsic nature and purpose’ of the ‘several parts’ of the liturgy as well as ‘the connection between them’. Furthermore, through a ‘good understanding of the rites and prayers’ the faithful should be able to participate in the liturgy ‘conscious of what they are doing, with devotion and full collaboration’. Interestingly, Martos suggests that pastoral necessity was not the only reason. Throughout the twentieth century liturgical scholars had been drawing on patristic and scriptural sources, in seeking a continuity with earlier forms of celebrating the Eucharist and expanding on the scholastic and Tridentine understanding. It became apparent that although the Tridentine Mass had been ‘firmly fixed’ for four centuries, from earliest times the Roman Rite had seen many other adaptations. It was discovered that the Eucharist had been celebrated in languages other than Latin and that in the early Church lay people had taken on ‘an active role in Eucharistic worship’. Martos reflects that the fruit of these findings, was some ‘modest’ reform in the decade preceding the Council.

It is worth noting that the Latin language, of itself, is not the issue. In the Roman Rite, Latin is the original ‘ur-text’, from which each successive *editio typica* of the *Missale Romanum* (including the post-Vatican II Missals) is translated. While *Sacrosanctum Concilium* notes the ‘great advantage to the people’ of using their own language in the liturgy, it also encourages the continued use of Latin and proposes that ‘the faithful may also be able to say or to sing together in Latin those parts of the Ordinary of the Mass which pertain to them’. There is, therefore, scope for selective use of sung Latin in parish masses, for example in the Gloria, the Lamb of God (Agnes Dei) or other chants. At the same time, an especially pastoral section of *Sacrosanctum Concilium* teaches that the Church ‘earnestly desires’ that the faithful ‘should not be there as strangers or silent spectators’. Further, Christ’s faithful are to be led to a ‘good understanding of the rites and prayers’ and ‘be instructed by God’s word’. *Traditionis Custodes* mandates that readings in all Masses are to be proclaimed in the vernacular, ‘using translations of the Sacred Scripture approved for

28 SC, sec.50.
29 SC, sec.48.
30 Martos, *Doors to the Sacred*, 262.
31 Martos, *Doors to the Sacred*, 260.
32 Martos, *Doors to the Sacred*, 260.
34 James T. Keane, “Explainer: What is the history of the Latin Mass?”, *America Magazine*, 16 July 2021, [https://www.americamagazine.org/faith/2021/07/16/latin-mass-pope-francis-restrict-summorum-pontificum-benedict-241060?fbclid=IwAR1QDNC2aEvJ2vZKe2La3l0x5zoWHOThr_bylmnxNhSEaWgL2LYQmDxNWegb4](https://www.americamagazine.org/faith/2021/07/16/latin-mass-pope-francis-restrict-summorum-pontificum-benedict-241060?fbclid=IwAR1QDNC2aEvJ2vZKe2La3l0x5zoWHOThr_bylmnxNhSEaWgL2LYQmDxNWegb4).
35 SC, sec.36 #2.
36 SC, sec.54.
37 SC, sec.48.
38 SC, sec.48.
liturgical use’. Solari emphasises the importance for the Church to listen to the Word so that it ‘becomes’ Church: it is actually God’s Word that is actively bringing the Church into unity.\(^{40}\)

**TRIDENTINE MASS CONGREGATIONS**

Those who gather for the Tridentine Mass are a diverse group, with varying backgrounds and political orientation, according to Daniel McGlone who regularly attends a pre-Vatican II Mass in Ballarat.\(^{41}\) Many may be seeking a deeper and more reverent way of praying or ‘the extraordinary mysticism that the Catholic tradition had to offer’.\(^{42}\) Pope Benedict, in his 2007 letter accompanying the *motu proprio*, *Summorum Pontificum*, refers to the younger generations who ‘have discovered [the Tridentine Mass], felt its attraction and found in it a form of encounter … particularly suited to them’.\(^{43}\) McGlone concurs, and mentions the high number of young families who are part of the Latin Mass congregation he attends.\(^{44}\) Predictably, congregations also include older baby boomers or those who lived through World War II, for whom the Tridentine rite was their earliest memory of the Mass. It was from a sense of compassion for older Catholics that Pope Paul VI issued the 1971 Instruction that ‘provided for the celebration of Mass in the ancient form, with the authorisation of the ordinary, only for elderly or sick priests’ who pray the Mass without others in attendance.\(^{45}\) Since the promulgation of the reformed Missal in 1970 Catholics will have shared an enormous range of liturgical experiences. Frequently renewal was implemented with great enthusiasm, creativity and attempts at encouraging participation, however some of the faithful have looked for an alternative in the pre-Vatican II Mass.

**PASTORAL CONSIDERATIONS**

Commonly heard criticisms of post-Vatican II Eucharistic celebrations are lack of reverence, wordiness, lack of quality music and over-enthusiastic flourishes. Unsurprisingly Pope Francis, in continuity with his predecessor, is critical of the ‘abuses in the celebration of the liturgy’ and calls for bishops to ‘be vigilant in ensuring that every liturgy be celebrated with decorum and fidelity … without the eccentricities that can easily degenerate’.\(^{46}\) Pecklers has surveyed some of the issues which hinder proper celebration of the Eucharist. He identifies some key focus areas, in particular greater attention to the transcendent in the liturgy.\(^{47}\) Pecklers is at pains to emphasise that ‘the conciliar principle of full, active and conscious liturgical participation’ and attention to ‘a sense of mystery within worship’ are not ‘mutually exclusive.’\(^{48}\) He calls for increased focus on: liturgical formation; appropriate balance between immanence and transcendence; attention to the non-verbal, and attention to ‘the custody of words’.\(^{49}\)

Pecklers echoes the oft-heard lament that, immediately after Vatican II, there was insufficient catechesis on the reformed Mass, which sometimes led to well-meaning but inappropriate innovations.\(^{50}\) Writing during the advent of the third *editio typica*, Pecklers refers to the

\(^{39}\) Francis, *Traditionis Custodes*, Art. 3.

\(^{40}\) Solari, "Nostalgia for the past can no longer serve a pastoral model".


\(^{42}\) McGlone, “In Defence of the Traditional Latin Mass”.


\(^{44}\) McGlone, “In Defence of the Traditional Latin Mass”.

\(^{45}\) Paul VI, *Secret Consistory of the Holy Father Paul VI for the Appointment of Twenty Cardinals*, sec. 2a

\(^{46}\) Francis, *Letter of the Holy Father Francis to the bishops of the whole world*.

\(^{47}\) Pecklers, *The Genius of the Roman Rite*, 42.

\(^{48}\) Pecklers, *The Genius of the Roman Rite*, 43.

\(^{49}\) Pecklers, *The Genius of the Roman Rite*, 43.

\(^{50}\) Pecklers, *The Genius of the Roman Rite*, 42-44.
publication of excellent new catechetical resources.\textsuperscript{51} In reality, many (both clergy and laity) were disaffected by the 2002 Missale Romanum and/or the process of translation, and consequently eschewed catechetical opportunities and, tragically, another chance for liturgical catechesis and formation could not be fully exploited.\textsuperscript{52} Pecklers stresses the imperative of more and deeper formation – not only about the new Missal and its translation, but the ‘ecclesiological and missiological dimension’ of the Vatican II liturgy and ‘what our liturgical participation actually demands of us if we take it seriously’.\textsuperscript{53} Has Pope Francis offered yet another opportunity? In a letter to the clergy of Melbourne, Archbishop Peter Comensoli invited them to examine their consciences and ‘use this moment to better exercise the *ars celebrandi* and refresh their ‘conformity to the third typical edition of the Missale Romanum’.\textsuperscript{54} While addressed to clergy, it could also be a call to all God’s people to grow in understanding of celebrating and living according to the mission and ecclesiology taught through Vatican II.

As with his predecessors, Francis is sensitive to the pastoral needs of Catholics who are attached to more traditional prayer forms. Hence the provision to continue, with appropriate guidance from clergy. Another source of nourishment for those faithful who are attracted to a more traditional form of prayer, may be popular devotions. The use of popular devotions is ‘warmly commended’ according to Sacrosanctum Concilium, ‘provided they accord with the laws and norms of the Church’.\textsuperscript{55} Devotions such as the rosary – which may even be recited in Latin – may be easily facilitated in parishes without making additional demands on clergy. Adoration and Benediction are already on offer in many parishes and may ‘provide for the good of those who are rooted in the previous form of celebration’ but who are not rejecting the reforms of Vatican II.\textsuperscript{56} Parish priests may enlist the assistance of a deacon for Benediction – and, where possible, even a small choir to lead the chants.

**A PILGRIM PEOPLE**

*Traditionis Custodes*, Guardians of the Tradition: the *motu proprio* is directed to ‘the bishops in communion with the Bishop of Rome’.\textsuperscript{57} Might it be considered, additionally, as a new challenge to the people of God throughout the world – to be taken on in the spirit of humility that Pope Francis demands of the Church? Father Tom Elich, Director of Liturgy Brisbane, calls for renewed opportunities for the people of God ‘to understand the Vatican Council reforms and to experience the liturgy in its power’.\textsuperscript{58} Likewise, Cardinal Cupich notes that Pope Francis is calling on all Catholics to recognise the ‘authentic actions of the Holy Spirit’ in the work of the council and ‘to recognise that this work of the Spirit is ‘in continuity with the tradition of the Church’.\textsuperscript{59} The Australian Church, on its interweaving synodal and Plenary Council pathways, continues to listen for the Holy Spirit ‘who alone can lead us to the place where God wants us to be’ and who helps the faithful seek with more ‘intentionality’ the unity that only God can bring about.\textsuperscript{60, 61}

---


\textsuperscript{52} This was author’s observation of commentary and anecdotes from colleagues as well as parish and other contacts in the context of the new translation of the Roman Missal in Australia, 2011.

\textsuperscript{53} Pecklers, *The Genius of the Roman Rite*, 44.


\textsuperscript{55} SC, sec.13.

\textsuperscript{56} Francis, *Letter of the Holy Father Francis to the bishops of the whole world*.

\textsuperscript{57} Francis, *Traditionis Custodes*.

\textsuperscript{58} Elich, “Celebrating the Traditional Mass”, 8.

\textsuperscript{59} Cupich, “Pope Francis’ Latin Mass reforms are necessary to secure Vatican II’s legacy”.

\textsuperscript{60} Coleridge, “Homily at the Launch of Synod 2021-23”.

\textsuperscript{61} Pecklers, *The Genius of the Roman Rite*, 45.
The Eucharist is both a sign and source of the unity of God with humanity and of humans with one another. *Sacrosanctum Concilium* states that ‘in the earthly liturgy we take part in a foretaste of that heavenly liturgy’. 62 Referring to the Catechism, that the liturgy is ‘the work of God’, Rita Thiron calls congregations to remember that they are ‘part of a greater whole’ and that they are ‘[i]n communion with other assemblies around the world and with the heavenly hosts.’ 63, 64 In a preparatory paper for the Plenary Council, Father Noel Connolly outlines the emphasis that Vatican II gave to the entire people of God who are on mission: pope, bishops, priests and laity journeying in unity. 65 Connolly elaborates that this unity is God’s work: ‘[w]e are collaborating in something much larger than ourselves: God’s life and mission in the world’. 66 It is this understanding of unity, according to Connolly, that leads to enthusiasm, energy and hope. 67 Could this anniversary year be an invitation for a pilgrim people to more deeply engage with the vision of Vatican II?

62 SC, sec.8.
66 Connolly, “Realising the Dream of Vatican II”.
67 Connolly, “Realising the Dream of Vatican II”.

7